



Clean Space Days 2024: Towards a Sustainable Future in Space



Composite degradation model for spacecraft oriented tool : ESA GSTP : NEVADA Project

Numerical and Experimental VAlidation of spacecraft Demise during Atmospheric re-entry (Contract Ref: ESA AO/1-10448/20/NL/MG)

Speaker : Eddy CONSTANT : Email: eddy.constant@rtech-engineering.com, Phone: +33 (0)9-72-48-08-88

ESA Technical Officer : Louis Walpot CNES Technical Adviser: Julien Annaloro





Walpot Louis : **ESA** Annaloro Julien; Galera Stephane : **CNES** Constant Eddy; Martin Spel; Brives Gauthier; Martinez Thomas : **R.Tech** Reulet Philippe : **ONERA** Balat-Pichelin Marianne : **PROMES** Bultel Arnaud : **CORIA** Lachaud Jean : **University of Bordeaux** Helber Bernd; Holum Sander : **VKI**

October 8th 2024



Objectives & Approach



Objectives



- To increase the knowledge of the degradation of space debris during re-entry.
- **Enhance the predictive capabilities of the high-fidelity and spacecraft-oriented numerical tools**
- Numerically reconstruct data measured in high enthalpy facilities and reactors operated under representative flight conditions
- **Reduce the risk of casualties from uncontrolled** re-entry by reducing the amount of debris that survives re-entry.

Approach

- Various materials (including CFRP, AISI 304L steel, Haynes 25) will be tested and analysed to provide material properties and tools capable of modelling their atmospheric re-entry, as much of the debris found on the ground consists of these materials.
 - A comprehensive experimental database will provide insight into degradation and fragmentation processes and enrich the current ESA ESTIMATE database.
- Development of low cost, multi-physics, multi-scale methods capable of handling the demise of these materials for spacecraft-oriented tools.





Ti (up) and COPV (down) tanks found in India













Objectives:

- Development of cost-effective, multi-physics, multi-scale methods able to handle the demise of these materials for spacecraft oriented tools to strengthen the predictive capabilities of the debris reentry
- Rebuild numerically the data measured in high-enthalpy facilities and reactors operated at representative flight conditions

Target tool : PAMPERO : French spacecraft-oriented tool (100% CNES)

- **Perform computations for sensitive objects** reaching the ground close to the 14J limit
- Perform computations for very **complex objects** (not available within object-oriented tools)
- Perform **D4D computations** for future missions
- Support **experts** for the **fragmentation** modelling



AVUM re entry



- Fast assessment
- Robust

Simplified aerothermodynamics

Shape change

- Integrated 6 Degrees of Freedom (6DOF)
- Integrated Thermal response 3D implicit+s2s
- Thermo mechanical Fragmentation (3D dynamic FEM)
- Ablation
- Integrated High-temperature material response
 - characterized Material through CNES data base
 - Melting
 - Pyrolysis, oxidation, etc.



TARANIS degradation



High-Fidelity CFRP model for PAMPERO

The main question : can we implement a high fidelity model inside a spacecraft oriented tool with in depth pyrolysis and 3D gas transport (instead of engineering correlations) \rightarrow yes with several optimizations

Computational time reduced thanks to a 3D implicit resolution of the Mass/Momentum/Energy conservation \rightarrow 5h for a full trajectory simulation on a 400k cells mesh (300k cells usually used to model a full satellite)

The model is already in use for 2 CNES industrial projects :

- JASON demise analysis : 2 days of simulation on 32 cores with Solar panels and 2 dish antenna in CFRP
- EADS Tanks : preliminary study of the feasibility of aluminium liners in COPV tanks)

Cfrp tank degradation







JASON degradation





5

.





VKI experiment





VKI experimental set up

Measured final recession :





Recession points measurement

Material	Angle attack (°)	of	Mass flow (g/s)	Heating (s)
HAYNES	10		6	360
HAYNES	10		12	230
CFRP	10		6	600
CFRP	10		12	480
STEEL	10		6	600

VKI experimental test cases

Front face temperature





Temperature at center of the plate Temperature on the centerline at different timestep

Thermocouple Layout

 Θ

(J) (4) (3) (6)

 \bigcirc





VKI experiments – thermocouples on the back face



Materials: CFRP from MECANO ID (Toulouse France)

ONERA Facilities for the CFRP characterisation :

	Mettler Toledo TGA/DSC3+ with Adethec toolbox	HR-TGA	BLADE	Bruker- Equinox Lambda 1050
Facility specificati on	 Max Temp. 1100°C Air/N2 Atmosphere 	 Temperature up to 1500°C Heating rate from 5°C/min to 1500°C/min Helium Atmosphere 	- LT : 20 – 80°C - HT : 60 – 600°C	- Ambient Temperat ure
Property measured	Arrhenius model for thermo-chemical reactions : • Resin pyrolysis • Char oxidation • Fiber oxidation	 Mass loss rate at high heating rates -> Arrhenius model 	 3 thermal conductiv ities k_x, k_y, k_z Specific heat 	 IR emissivity UV/near- IR absoptivit Y
Sample	Virgin	Virgin	Virgin Degraded	Virgin Degraded



CORIA proposed to use its expertise in LIBS (Laser-Induced Breakdown Spectroscopy) to determine the multi-elemental composition of the tested resin

After processing the spectra, the following composition of the **pyrolysis gas** is deduced:

<i>y_c</i> = 48 %	$x_C = \frac{[C]}{[C] + [H] + [N] + [CO]} = 0.216$
<i>y_H</i> = 12 %	$x_H = \frac{[H]}{[C] + [H] + [N] + [CO]} = 0.642$
$\boldsymbol{y}_N = 8 \%$	$x_N = \frac{[N]}{[C] + [H] + [N] + [CO]} = 0.033$
<i>y</i> ₀ = 32 %	$x_0 = \frac{[0]}{[C] + [H] + [N] + [CO]} = 0.109$

Composition of Pyrolysis Gas : uncertainty 8%



High Fidelity model



High Fidelity Coupling strategy overview (code NEVADA C.T. : NEVADA Coupling Toolbox)



Evolution of fluid/structure interaction

Fluid Modeling : MISTRAL

RTech in-house CFD tool

- Navier-Stokes
- Non-equilibrium reactive chemistry

Physico-chemical models

Vibrational, electronic relaxation High-temperature thermodynamics, transport

Homogeneous chemical kinetics (atmosphere)

Numerical schemes

Time integration: usual and inhouse schemes Space integration: usual and inhouse schemes Method: Finite volume integration: GMRES, inviscid fluxes: AUSM/VanLeer



Solid modeling : PATO

Open source In-depth material response toolbox based on OpenFOAM

- Multiphase porous reactive materials
- Internal decomposition (pyrolysis, vaporization)
- Gas-gas and gas-solid chemical reaction
- Gas species transport (convection, diffusion)
- Solid morphology evolution (internal density change, surface ablation)





Mistral coputation



PAMPERO Model



PAMPERO : CFRP model

The main question : can we implement a high fidelity model inside a spacecraft oriented tool with in deph pyrolysis and 3D gas transport (instead of engineering correlations) → yes with several optimizations

Pyrolysis process and gas fluxes generation:

 $\pi_{tot} = \rho_{resine} \varepsilon_{resine} F \frac{\partial \xi}{\partial t}$ $\Delta m_{pg} = -\pi_{tot} \times V_p \Delta t$

 $egin{aligned} rac{\partial \xi}{\partial t} &= \mathcal{A} \, T_P{}^\eta \, exp(rac{\mathcal{E}}{RT_P}) \, (1-\xi)^m \ & \ arepsilon_g &= arepsilon_{resine}^{t0} imes \xi \end{aligned}$

with:

- ξ : Advancement of pyrolysis reaction (SI)
- T_P : Temperature at the current cell P where the reaction is computed (K)
- \mathcal{A} : Pre-exponential factor of pyrolysis reaction (SI)
- ${\cal E}$: Activation energy of pyrolysis reaction (J/kg)
- η : Calibration exponent
- m: Arrhenius law factor of pyrolysis reaction (J/kg)

Degradation (VOF analogy) :

$$m(t+dt)=m(t)+\Delta m_{pg}(t)+\Delta m_{ca}(t)$$

with :

- $\Delta m_{pg}(t)$, the mass lost through the pyrolysis of the epoxy resin
- $\Delta m_{ca}(t)$, the mass lost through chemical ablation of the char $C_{(s)}$

If $m(t+dt) \leq 0$, the cell is fully ablated and removed from the solid.

Calibrated by Jean Lachaud with ONERA characterization \rightarrow creation of an opensource tool for automatical calibration as function of burned gases

$$u_{fiber} = rac{V_{fiber}}{V_{fiber} + V_{resin} + V_{gas} + V_{char}}$$

$$u_{fiber} +
u_{resin} +
u_{gas} +
u_{char} = 1$$

volume density (kg/m3) ratio fibre 1800 0,56 resin 1280 0,43



Préliminary computation NEVADA





PAMPERO Model

PAMPERO : CFRP model



The main question : can we implement a high fidelity model inside a spacecraft oriented tool with in deph pyrolysis and 3D gas transport (instead of engineering correlations) → yes with several optimizations

Gas Transport models through the Solid

Solid Energy equation

Perfect Gas assumption :

$$\rho_g = \frac{M_g p_g}{R T_g}$$

 ε_{σ} : gas volume fraction

$$\int_{t}^{t+\Delta t} [\int_{V_{p}} rac{\partial(
ho(T)c_{p}(T)T)}{\partial t} dV_{P}] dt = \int_{t}^{t+\Delta t} [\int_{V_{p}} ec{
abla} \cdot (\kappa(T)ec{
abla}T) dV_{p}] dt \ + \int_{t}^{t+\Delta t} [\int_{V_{p}} \dot{E}_{pyrolysis} dV_{P}] dt \ + \int_{t}^{t+\Delta t} [\oint_{S} (\sigma\epsilon(T)T^{4} + q_{conv} + q_{pyrolysis} + q_{ox})ec{n}dS_{p}] dt$$

Mass conservation equation :

$$\frac{\partial \rho_g}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial (\epsilon_g \rho_g v_g)}{\partial x} = \pi_{tot}$$

Momentum equation (assumption of creeping flow in the continuum regime through the pores) :

$$v_g = -\frac{1}{\epsilon} \left(\frac{1}{\mu} K_s\right) \frac{\partial(p_g)}{\partial x}$$

Surface balance :

$$q_{conv} - (
ho \ v) \ h_w + q_{rad,in} - q_{rad,out} - q_{cond} + \dot{m}_{pg} \ h_{pg} + \dot{m}_{ca} \ h_{ca} = 0$$







Simulations for rebuilding :



About 150 NEVADA C.T. simulations and >500 PAMPERO simulations have been launched during the project

Material	NEVADA C.T. (MISTRAL/PATO/GridPro/BLEED)	PAMPERO
Timestep	maximal timestep of 1 ^e -4s for CFRP	timestep of 0,1 seconds (and 250 sub iterations for CFRP Gas Transport)
Computational time	~month for CFRP (due to problem stifeness) , days(5) for metals	Days for CFRP (2 days), hours for metals
Modeling	2D	3D
Recession	Mesh deformation	Pseudo VOF

Thanks to an R.Tech software named Zephyr (which can convert a step into a PAMPERO mesh), the real geometry can directly be used inside PAMPERO. The water has been modeled as a thermal sink and is meshed as well.





PAMPERO Mesh



Sensitivity analysis



Uncertainties and Sensitivity analysis :

The analyzed uncertainties are the following : 500< PAMPERO Computations

- Numerical methods uncertainties
- Freestream condition
- Glued thermocouple could impact the results
- Pre-heated plate
- Boundary conditions

Degradation modelling

Some material degradations are not taken into account by the simulation models:

- **Swelling for CFRP**: it has been shown that it could have a strong impact on the temperature prediction in [1]
- **Delamination for CFRP**: it has been shown that it could have a strong impact on the temperature prediction in [1]



swelling observed on CFRP plate at 10°

- Equipments Contacts
- CFRP material properties
- Material Degradation
- Turbulence
- Mesh convergence
- Catalycity

Lack of DATA at high temperature : The

conductivity/heat capacities have been measured at relatively low temperatures (up to 450°K for virgin and 300°K for degraded CFRP) to avoid any

degradation during the characterization

NEVADA Approach

PAMPERO model validation with

Higher Fidelity tools : NEVADA C.T. :

<u>Successfull</u>





case 12g/s



Rebuilding on 2nd VKI test case 6g/s



Theoritical influence of each thermal parameter on front and back face temperature [1]



One of the variation with PAMPERO of material properties at high temperature – Back Face Thermocouples

[1] X. Wang, Modelisation of the thermal degradation of composites in order to predict their fire reaction when they are exposed to flames, https://theses.hal.science/tel-04269903, 2023.

12





Results : Temperature





Front face temperature at centerline for different times (60; 120; 180; 240; 600) comparison of Experiment and simulation

The temperature distribution over the plate is similar.

The degradation occurs also the same way between PAMPERO and the experiments



Front and back Temperature as function of time. comparison of Experiment and simulation 13

PAMP, CFRP3_6gs_1_3D_method_Catalytic-Constant-Law-E
 Experiment - Thermocouple
 PAMP_CFRP3_6gs_1_3D_method_Catalytic-Constant-Law-E



VON KARMAN INSTITUTE

Results : Degradation



Results : STEEL 6gs

Ablation

cnes

The degradation is about **78% of the initial mass in** simulation compared to the experimental material degradation about **78%**.



Screenshot of the final degradation of the sample. Experiment (up) and Simulation (down) - CFRP - 10deg - 6g/s

In the comparison of the final sample to the sample at the end of the simulation we can observe a **similar ablation behavior and a similar recession :**

3,9 mm in simulation and 3,3 mm in the experiment at center of the plate (the small discrepancy \rightarrow swelling ?)



Recession ratio evolution compare to final recession ratio - CFRP - 10 ° - 6g/s





The objectives of the current study were successfully met :



- To improve the knowledge of the degradation of space debris during re-entry
- Strengthen the predictive capabilities of the high-fidelity and spacecraft-oriented numerical tools currently in use.
- Numerically reconstruct data measured in high-enthalpy facilities and reactors operated under representative flight condition

An explicit coupling strategy (called NEVADA C.T.) of RTech's in-house high-fidelity tool Mistral with the OpenFOAM-based material response solver PATO was then developed to provide a cross-check verification code for the spacecraft-oriented tool and to numerically rebuild the experiments in the VKI facilities.

Extensive efforts were made to develop such tools/models in terms of **accuracy and CPU optimization**. The reconstruction activity has allowed the improvement of our tools, in particular the new version v3 of PAMPERO shows **good agreement with the experiments in terms of mass, recession rate and front and back surface temperature.**

NEVADA C.T. and PAMPERO show good agreement and PAMPERO allows a **great speed-up for the calculation of the thermal response** (**1-2 months** calculation for NEVADA C.T. against **2 days for PAMPERO**), allowing to handle industrial cases.

The final objective, to provide a code to reduce the uncertainties on the risk of casualties from uncontrolled re-entry, was fully **achieved during this activity**.





The study shows that **significant effort is still required** to correctly characterize the **thermal properties of** \cdots **composite** (especially in a degraded state at high temperature) and to take into account **phenomena such as swelling** and delamination which has to be modelled to properly model an atmospheric re-entry of such materials

Further effort will be made on to these points in order to assess the full degradation process of industrial geometries.

- □ To do so several characterization are still required (at iso fluxes) for char and virgin materials in order to correctly assess CFRP material properties. This would ensure the thermal behavior of such material during heating phase/pyrolysis. A coupling of PAMPERO and Dakota could be used to fit the material properties at really high temperature
- □ **To address swelling**, a development on PATO is on-going but on material such as wood. A development/validation with tests of the swelling for CFRP during atmospheric re-entry is required to evaluate with accuracy the thermal raise.
- □ To address delamination, a complet strategy is under reflexion for another GSTP including more test cases and Simulations

These 3 developments would ensure a correct estimation of thermal raise in satellite equipment's during reentry once such phenomena (swelling/Pyrolysis/delamination) occur







Questions



Upcoming : New release of PAMPERO :

PAMPERO Hi-Fi









Back Up





Back Up







TGA/DSC3+

- Assess simultaneously mass loss and reaction enthalpies during the decomposition process
- Tmax = 1100°C
- Air/N2 atmosphere



- ADETHEC toolbox
 - Analyse and model thermo-chemical reactions
 - n solid species and r reactions
 - 3 stage Arrhenius model for TGA fitting of a CFRP decomposition









HR-TGA

- Identification of degradation kinetics at high heating rates
- Temperature up to 1500°C
- Heating rates from 5°C/min to 1500°/min
- Helium atmosphere
- Mass loss rate measured with Setaram CS32 balance
 - Up to 400mg relative mass loss
 - 6µm precision









Optical suface properties

- **Spectral emissivity** measurements :
 - Ambient temperature
 - Bruker-Equinox => IR: $1.3-27 \mu m$
 - Lambda 1050 from Perkin-Elmer => UV/near IR: 175-2500 nm
- 2 material states
- Virgin (initial): resin + fibres
- Degraded: char + fibres





CENTRE NATIONAL

BLADE

- BLADE-LT
 - Range 20-80°C
 - Sample size 80x80 mm²
- BLADE-HT
 - Range 60-600°C
 - Sample size 100x100 mm²

• Properties

- 3 thermal conductivities: k_x , k_y , k_z
- specific heat
- as a function of temperature
- 2 material states
 - Virgin (initial): resin + fibres
 - Degraded: char + fibres









CENTRE NATIONAL

BLADE

- BLADE-LT
 - Range 20-80°C
 - Sample size 80x80 mm²
- BLADE-HT
 - Range 60-600°C
 - Sample size 100x100 mm²

• Properties

- 3 thermal conductivities: k_x , k_y , k_z
- specific heat
- as a function of temperature
- 2 material states
 - Virgin (initial): resin + fibres
 - Degraded: char + fibres









PAMPERO : CFRP model : VOF analogy

$ u_{fiber} = rac{V_{fiber}}{V_{fiber} + V_{resin} + V_{gas} + V_{char}}$		
$ u_{fiber} + u_{resin} + u_{gas} + u_{char} = 1$	fibres	Pyrolys
	resin	
$(c_{1}(T))_{1} = (1 - \xi) (c_{1}(T)) + (-\xi) (c_{2}(T)) = 0$	Virgin	





 $(c_p(I))_{degraded} = (I - \zeta) (c_p(I))_{virgin} + \zeta (c_p(I))_{graphite}$

 ϵ is the advancement rate of the pyrolysis reaction, see next section Pyrolysis reaction





PAMPERO : CFRP model : VOF analogy

$$m(t+dt) = m(t) + \Delta m_{pg}(t) + \Delta m_{ca}(t)$$

with :

• $\Delta m_{pg}(t)$, the mass lost through the pyrolysis of the epoxy resin • $\Delta m_{ca}(t)$, the mass lost through chemical ablation of the char $C_{(s)}$

If $m(t + dt) \leq 0$, the cell is fully ablated and removed from the solid.

		volume
	density (kg/m3)	ratio
fibre	1800	0,56
résine	1280	0,43







Pyrolysis process and gas fluxes generation:

The physic taken into account is :





Perfect Gas assumption :

$$\rho_g = \frac{M_g p_g}{R T_g}$$

Mass conservation equation :

$$\frac{\partial \rho_g}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial (\epsilon_g \rho_g v_g)}{\partial x} = \pi_{tot}$$

Momentum equation (assumption of creeping flow in the continuum regime through the pores) :

$$v_g = -\frac{1}{\epsilon} \left(\frac{1}{\mu} K_s\right) \frac{\partial(p_g)}{\partial x}$$

 $\begin{array}{l} \epsilon_g : gas \ volume \ fraction \\ M_g : gas \ molar \ mass \\ Ks : permeability \\ \mu_g : gas \ dyamic \ viscosity \\ \pi_{tot} : pyrolysis \ production \ rate \ kg.m^{-3}.s^{-1} \end{array}$









1D solution – velocity assumption :

 $v_g = 1D \ approximation \ based \ on \ PATO \ results$

$$V_g = V_0 \left(1 - \frac{d}{d_{max}} \right) e^{-Ad}$$

 $v_g = v_0$ on external surface and 0 at the limit of pyrolyzed cell



3D solution – system resolution:

Semi-implicite resolution on ρ_g with sub iterations









3D solution – system resolution: Semi-implicite resolution on ρ_{g} with sub iterations Time step : $\Delta m_{p,q} = -\pi_{tot} \times V_p \Delta t$ **Pyrolysis** $\frac{\partial \rho_g}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial (\epsilon_g \rho_g v_g)}{\partial x} = \pi_{tot} \quad \rho_g = \frac{M_g p_g}{R T_g}$ $v_g = -\frac{1}{\epsilon} \left(\frac{1}{\mu} K_s\right) \frac{\partial(p_g)}{\partial x}$ Gas Transport **Energy computation / surface recession** Time step : $t + \Delta t$ 30







1D solution – velocity assumption :

Ray – Casting in each face direction to build a 1D connectivity through all cells of the mesh



```
3D solution – system resolution:
    Semi-implicite resolution on \rho_g with sub iterations
    Time step :
                                                             \Delta m_{p,q} = -\pi_{tot} \times V_p \Delta t
               Pyrolysis
                                                    \frac{\partial \rho_g}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial (\epsilon_g \rho_g v_g)}{\partial x} = \pi_{tot} \quad \rho_g = \frac{M_g p_g}{R T_g}
                                                     v_g = -\frac{1}{\epsilon} \left(\frac{1}{\mu} K_s\right) \frac{\partial(p_g)}{\partial x}
            Gas Transport
Energy computation / surface recession
```







PAMPERO : CFRP – Energy computation

Energy equation :

33





34

PAMPERO : CFRP – Energy computation

Energy storage term :







Pyrolysis gas convective heat flux density term :

the convective heat flux density transported by the pyrolysis gas throughout its way out of the material





Bprime model was developed in the 1960s by the Aerotherm Company under NASA funding.

It is a state-of-the-art model for reactive boundary layers to couple material and flow simulation.

Surface recession : B' Model

Surface balance :







Bprime model was developed in the 1960s by the Aerotherm Company under NASA funding. It is a state-of-the-art model for reactive boundary layers to couple material and flow simulation.

Surface recession : B' Model

Surface balance :

The corrected Stanton number takes the form :





With :

$$B'_{ca} = \frac{\dot{m_c}}{\rho_e u_e Ch}$$

 $B'_{pg} = \frac{\dot{m_{pg}}}{\rho_e u_e Ch}$





Bprime model was developed in the 1960s by the Aerotherm Company under NASA funding. It is a state-of-the-art model for reactive boundary layers to couple material and flow simulation.

Surface recession : B' Model







39

Bprime model was developed in the 1960s by the Aerotherm Company under NASA funding. It is a state-of-the-art model for reactive boundary layers to couple material and flow simulation.

Surface recession : B' Model

Surface balance :

A thermo-chemical equilibrium and element conservation is considered







Bprime model was developed in the 1960s by the Aerotherm Company under NASA funding. It is a state-of-the-art model for reactive boundary layers to couple material and flow simulation.

Surface recession : B' Model

Surface balance :

Equation could be solved with mutation ++







Bprime model was developed in the 1960s by the Aerotherm Company under NASA funding. It is a state-of-the-art model for reactive boundary layers to couple material and flow simulation.

Surface recession : B' Model

Surface balance :



For Pampero, a utility from open-source software PATO is used to generate a Bprime interpolation table.

From this table can be interpolated as a function of (T, p, Bpg') the dimensionless mass transfer for char Bca' and the wall enthalpy hw. This utility calls Mutation ++ to generate the table with Bprime coefficients and wall enthalpy hw for a range of pressures and temperatures.

Using the interpolation table rather than solving the chemical equilibrium composition decreases the computational time.





Uncertainties and Sensitivity analysis : thermocouple

The presence of adhesive mounting of the sensors could disturb the measurement which in results impact the comparison with the simulations





Back face of CFRP plate before (left) and after (right) test

Observed CFRP Pyrolyze pattern compared to thermocouple position





Uncertainties and Sensitivity analysis : Material properties

The emissivities have been studied up to high temperatures but are slightly different from VKI measurements



Emissivities measured at ONERA (left) VKI (right)

Both emissivities has been used





Uncertainties and Sensitivity analysis : Material properties

The conductivity/heat capacities has been measured at relatively low temperatures (up to 450°C for virgin and 300K for degraded CFRP) to avoid any degradation during the characterization



Sample characterized at ONERA

Conductivities/heat capacity measured at ONERA





Uncertainties and Sensitivity analysis : Degradation modelling

Some material degradations are not taken into account by the simulation models:

• Swelling for CFRP: it has been shown that it could have a strong impact on the temperature prediction in [1]

A sensitivity analysis has been conduct with the effect of the step on the heat fluxes : the heat fluxes can see +50% by changing the step.



Step of the original plate

Effect of the step on the heat flux